WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Present-

Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal, Hon'ble Mr. P. Ramesh Kumar, Hon'ble Chairman & Administrative Member.

Case No. OA 922 of 2019. BHUDHAR MONDAL - VERSUS- THE STATE OF W.B. & OTHERS

BHUDHAR MONDAL - VERSUS- THE STATE OF W.B. & OTHERS.		
Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order.	2	and dated signature of parties when necessary
1		3
	For the Applicant : Mr. A.K. Niyogi,	
2	Advocate.	
9.1.2020.		
	For the State Respondent : Mr. S. Ghosh,	
	Advocate.	
	Affidavit of service filed today be kept on	
	record.	
	In this application Bhudhar Mondal, the	
	applicant, has prayed for certain reliefs, the relevant	
	portion of which is as under :-	
	"An order quashing and setting aside the	
	impugned order dated 14.8.18 which is Annexure "C" to	
	this application and further directing the said respondents	
	to give appointment to the applicant as Group "D"	
	employee forthwith with effect from the date from which	
	other empanelled candidates were given appointment	
	pursuant to the order of Hon'ble Apex Court".	
	It appears that the applicant was sponsored	
	by the Employment Exchange for appointment in Group	
	D post under the physically handicapped category. He	
	appeared in the competitive test and secured qualifying	
	marks. After interview, a panel was prepared. According	
	to the applicant, his name was empanelled under the	

Form No. BHUDHAR MONDAL.

Vs.

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	physically handicapped category. It appears from the	
	submission that during verification of the documents, it	
	was found that as the applicant had 30 per cent physical	
	ability and not 40 per cent, he could not be given	
	appointment. Thereafter, the applicant had filed	
	application before the Tribunal, being OA-671 of 2015,	
	which was disposed of on 28 th March, 2018 by passing an	
	order, the relevant portion of which is as under :-	
	"In view of our above findings, the	
	Respondent No.2, Director of Personnel & Ex-officio Chief	
	Engineer, Irrigation & Waterways Directorate,	
	Government of West Bengal is directed to consider	
	whether the applicant can be appointed in Group-D post	
	in the General Category within a period of 12 weeks from	
	the date of communication of the order. If the applicant is	
	appointed in Group-D post under General Category, the	
	seniority of the applicant will be counted from the date of	
	his actual joining in the post. With the above direction,	
	the original application is disposed of".	
	Pursuant to the said order, the Director of	
	Personal & Ex officio Chief Engineer, I & W Directorate,	
	the respondent no. 2, considered the matter and had	
	rejected the contention of the applicant by passing a	

Form No.

BHUDHAR MONDAL.

Vs.

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	reasoned order, the relevant portion of which is as under	
	:-	
	"Being aggrieved and dissatisfied with	
	the aforesaid decision the Applicant herein has moved the	
	instant original application before the Hon'ble WBAT	
	wherein vide order dt. 28.03.18 the Hon'ble Tribunal has	
	observed that there is justification for refusal to the	
	appointment of the applicant Group-D post in the	
	category of physically disabled person. However, vide the	
	said order the Tribunal considering the restorer position	
	of the applicant and the marks obtained by him directed	
	the undersigned to consider him for appointment under	
	Group-D post in the General Category now the age of Sri	
	Bhudhar Mondal i.e. applicant herein as on 01.01.06 was	
	41 years 7 months 24 days is his date of birth by	
	07.05.1964 as per the Admit card of West Bengal Board	
	of Secondary Education. He considered under physically	
	disabled category after giving him age relaxation as per	
	prevailing rules, which is not available to the general	
	caste candidates where the bigger age limit as per the	
	then prevailing norms was 37 years.	
	In the context it is pertinent to mention here that in the	
	absence of specific rules of recruitment and	

Form No.

BHUDHAR MONDAL.

Vs.

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	advertisement in the newspaper the date of	
	determination of minimum age for recruitment to Group	
	D posts will be governed by the notification dated	
	17.02.1995 issued by the Directorate of Employment with	
	the concurrence of Finance department Govt. of West	
	Bengal the relevant portion of the notification dt.	
	17.02.1995 may be reproduced below:	
	Unless specifically mentioned in the recruitment rules the	
	prescribed age limits both lower and upper should be as	
	on the first date of the year of recruitment i.e. the year	
	when the procedure for recruitment has been taken up by	
	the application authority in case of vacancies under the	
	state Govt. of undertaking and in local bodies.	
	as such it is amply clear that in terms of the above	
	notification in absence of recruitment rules the minimum	
	and maximum age of recruitment to Group-D posts will	
	be decided as on the first date of the year of recruitment.	
	Here the first date of the instant recruitment process is to	
	be considered as on 01.01.2006. The aforesaid	
	recruitment process was conducted inviting names from	
	employment exchange by the authority concerned though	
	some candidates were also appeared through court	
	orders. As such in the absence of specific recruitment	

Form No.

BHUDHAR MONDAL.

Vs.

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	rules in this regard in respect of the instant recruitment	
	process and in absence of any advertisement in the	
	newspaper cut off date for deciding the eligibility of the	
	candidates is to be considered as on 01.01.2006 for which	
	the applicant herein namely Sri Bhudhar Mondal cannot	
	be considered under General Category owing to his over	
	age as on 01.01.2006.	
	Based on the above said facts, circumstances and	
	prevalent rules and regulations of the Government	
	considering the instant mater in compliance of the direct	
	actives of the Hon'ble WBAT is hereby decided that Sri	
	Bhudhar Mondal cannot be considered for recruitment in	
	Group D post under I & W Directorate in the General	
	Category".	
	We find that the State authorities had	
	considered the application of the applicant in the General	
	category as directed by the Tribunal. As in the general	
	category the cut-off age is 37 years and the applicant is	
	over-aged and as the rule mentioned in the impugned	
	order has not been challenged, no order can be passed.	
	The application is disposed of.	
Skg.	(P. Ramesh Kumar) (Soumitra Pal) Member (A) Chairman.	

Form No. BHUDHAR MONDAL.

Vs.

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order.	2	and dated signature
1	_	of parties when necessary
1		3